

From: OCR
To: OCR Boston
Cc: (b)(6); (b)(7)(A); (b)(7)(C)
Subject: FW: Federal Civil Rights Complaint Concerning Antisemitic Harassment at Yale University
Date: Tuesday, December 5, 2023 3:40:51 PM
Attachments: OCR Yale Complaint Final.pdf.TXT

December 5, 2023

Dear OCR Boston Office,

The attachment above and email below are being forwarded to your office for review and appropriate handling.

Thank you,

OPEN Center Customer Service Team

Office for Civil Rights

U.S. Department of Education

From: Martha Astor (b)(6); (b)(7)(A); (b)(7)(C)
Sent: Tuesday, December 5, 2023 2:54 PM
To: OCR <OCR@ed.gov>
Subject: Federal Civil Rights Complaint Concerning Antisemitic Harassment at Yale University

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

You don't often get email from (b)(6); (b)(7)(A); (b)(7)(C) [Learn why this is important](#)

Ladies and Gentlemen:

Pursuant to the discrimination complaint resolution procedures of the U.S. Department of Education's Office for Civil Rights ("OCR"), DFI brings the attached federal civil rights complaint against Yale University for discrimination on the basis of (i) shared ancestry or ethnic characteristics; and (ii) citizenship or residency in a country with a dominant religion or distinct religious identity in programs or activities that receive federal financial assistance. DFI files this complaint as an interested third-party organization that strongly advocates for a republic where freedom, opportunity, creativity, and innovation flourish in our schools. Accordingly, DFI files the foregoing to request that OCR investigate the events described below and put Yale University on clear notice that its failure to fulfill its duty under federal civil rights law to protect Jewish students from such antisemitic attacks will result in the withdrawal of federal funding.

Should you have any questions about this complaint, please contact Donald Daugherty at (b)(6); (b)(7)(A); (b)(7)(C) or (b)(6); (b)(7)(A); (b)(7)(C) Mr.

Daugherty's business address is 1455 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, Suite 400, Washington, DC 20004.

Thank you,

Donald A. Daugherty, Jr.

December 5, 2023

VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL TO OCR@ed.gov

U.S. Department of Education
Office for Civil Rights
400 Maryland Avenue, SW
Washington, DC 20202-1100

Re: Federal Civil Rights Complaint Concerning Antisemitic Harassment at Yale University

To Whom It May Concern:

The Defense of Freedom Institute for Policy Studies (“DFI”) is a national, nonprofit organization dedicated to defending and advancing freedom and opportunity for every American family, student, entrepreneur, and worker and to protecting the civil and constitutional rights of Americans at school and in the workplace.

Pursuant to the discrimination complaint resolution procedures of the U.S. Department of Education’s Office for Civil Rights (“OCR”), DFI brings this federal civil rights complaint against Yale University for discrimination on the basis of (i) shared ancestry or ethnic characteristics; and (ii) citizenship or residency in a country with a dominant religion or distinct religious identity¹ in programs or activities that receive federal financial assistance. DFI files this complaint as an interested third-party organization that strongly advocates for a republic where freedom, opportunity, creativity, and innovation flourish in our schools. Accordingly, DFI files the foregoing to request that OCR investigate the events described below and put Yale University on clear notice that its failure to fulfill its duty under federal civil rights law to protect Jewish students from such antisemitic attacks will result in the withdrawal of federal funding.

On November 6, 2023, Yale University hosted an event called “Gaza Under Siege – Can you Hear Us Now?: Research And The Temporalities Of War A Yale Ethnography Hub Series” which was cosponsored by Yale’s Department of American Studies, Department of Anthropology, Program on Ethnicity, Race & Migration, Department of Religious Studies, Women, Gender, & Sexuality Studies, Center For Middle East Studies, Yale Ethnography Hub, The Edward J. And Dorothy Clarke Kempf Memorial Fund, Yalies4palestine, and Black Feminist.² The event was structured

¹ See *T.E. v. Pine Bush Cent. Sch. Dist.*, 58 F. Supp. 3d 332, 353-55 (S.D.N.Y. 2014) (holding that discrimination based on shared ancestry and ethnic characteristics is prohibited by Title VI); see also 42 U.S.C. § 2000d; 34 C.F.R. § 100.3(b)(1)(iv) and (vi).

² Jolie Sherman, *Yale University Students Raise Concerns About Recent Panel Discussion on Israel-Hamas War*, NBC CONNECTICUT (Nov. 8, 2023, 7:25 PM), available at <https://www.nbcconnecticut.com/news/local/yale-university-students-raise-concerns-about-recent-panel-discussion-on-israel-hamas-war/3144397/>.



as a panel discussion on the Israel-Hamas war and was supposed to be open to members of the Yale community with a Yale ID. However, several Jewish students, including sophomore, Sahar Tartak, and junior, Netanel Crispe, were denied entry to the event, despite attendees leaving the lecture before its conclusion. Some of the Jewish students who were denied access to the event were handing out flyers to provide historical context surrounding the Israel-Hamas war just prior to the commencement of the panel, while others who were excluded were wearing Jewish paraphernalia. Moreover, several of those excluded from the event claim that the organizers selectively enforced the registration requirement, leading to the admittance of several non-Jewish, non-registered guests.

In response to the incident, the university published a statement claiming that pre-registration was a requirement for attendance at “[o]ne of several educational events on campus about the Hamas-Israel war [that] took place on Monday, Nov. 6.”³ However, neither the event's flyer, nor the website for the event, nor the registration page for the event mentions that registration was a prerequisite for admittance.⁴ The university claims that the discriminatory behavior and access issues during the “Gaza Under Siege” panel discussion are under investigation, both by the university's administrative review process and the Yale Police. To date, the university has not issued an announcement concerning how it intends to take any disciplinary actions against the faculty members and students responsible for planning the event and excluding Jewish students.

OCR’s Legal Authority and Duties Under Title VI

Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 (“Title VI”) provides that “[n]o person in the United States shall, on the ground of race, color, or national origin, be excluded from participation in, be denied the benefits of, or be subjected to discrimination under any program or activity receiving Federal financial assistance.”⁵ The law directs federal agencies, including the U.S. Department of Education, to carry out this mandate by issuing rules conditioning the continued receipt of federal funding on compliance with the anti-discriminatory objectives of the statute.⁶ The Department interprets Title VI to prohibit harassment on the basis of race, color, or national origin “that, based on the totality of circumstances, is subjectively and objectively offensive and is so severe or pervasive that it limits or denies a person’s ability to participate in or benefit from the recipient’s education program or activity.”⁷

Pursuant to its regulations implementing Title VI, OCR “will make a prompt investigation” upon receipt of a complaint that “indicates a possible failure” to abide by Title VI.⁸ Such an investigation may result in “the suspension or termination of or refusal to grant or to continue Federal financial

³ See <https://news.yale.edu/2023/11/08/university-statement-faculty-led-event-held-monday-nov-6>.

⁴ See <https://ethnography.yale.edu/gaza-under-siege/>.

⁵ 42 U.S.C. § 2000d.

⁶ 42 U.S.C. § 2000d-1.

⁷ Catherine E. Lhamon, Assistant Secretary for Civil Rights, U.S. Department of Education, Dear Colleague Letter, Nov. 7, 2023, at 2, available at <https://www2.ed.gov/about/offices/list/ocr/letters/colleague-202311-discrimination-harassment-shared-ancestry.pdf> (citing *Zeno v. Pine Plains Cent. Sch. Dist.*, 702 F.3d 655, 670 n.14 (2d Cir. 2012); OCR’s Racial Incidents and Harassment Against Students at Educational Institutions Investigative Guidance, 59 Fed. Reg. 11448, 11450 (Mar. 10, 1994)).

⁸ 34 C.F.R. § 100.7(c).



assistance or by any other means authorized by law,” including referral to the U.S. Department of Justice for enforcement proceedings.⁹ For years, the Department has interpreted Title VI to prohibit discrimination, including harassment, on the basis of an individual or group’s actual or perceived “shared ancestry or ethnic characteristics” or “citizenship or residency in a country with a dominant religion or distinct religious identity.”¹⁰ In 2019, President Trump issued an executive order declaring that “[i]t shall be the policy of the executive branch to enforce Title VI against prohibited forms of discrimination rooted in anti-Semitism as vigorously as against all other forms of discrimination prohibited by Title VI”.¹¹ President Biden has not withdrawn E.O. 13899. Notably, despite the prior administration having finalized a proposed rule clarifying OCR’s Title VI enforcement responsibilities with respect to antisemitic discrimination and harassment, the current administration has inexplicably failed to publish those proposed regulations.

The incident at Yale University reflects a worrisome trend: Antisemitic discrimination at colleges and universities has risen over the past decade.¹² Furthermore, the Hamas attacks, which resulted in the wholesale slaughter of approximately 1,200 innocent men, women, and children in Israel and the taking of hundreds of hostages, have galvanized a growing antisemitic movement to wage a war of intimidation that deprive Sahar Tartak, Netanel Crispe, and other Jewish students of their right to an education free of discrimination and harassment. DFI urges OCR to investigate the allegations in this complaint and ensure that Yale University complies with Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, as well as provide other appropriate relief.

Please feel free to contact me with any questions related to this request.

Sincerely,

/s/ Donald A. Daugherty, Jr.
Donald A. Daugherty, Jr.
Senior Litigation Counsel

⁹ 34 C.F.R. § 100.8(a); *see also* CRS, Civil Rights at School: Agency Enforcement of Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, at 4 (2019), available at <https://crsreports.congress.gov/product/pdf/R/R45665> (citing *Nat’l Black Police Ass’n, Inc. v. Velde*, 712 F.2d 569, 575 (D.C. Cir. 1983) for the principle that the statutory language of Title VI contemplates as one mechanism of enforcement agencies’ referral of cases to the Attorney General for the purpose of filing a civil suit against the recipient).

¹⁰ *Id.* at 1-2 (citing *T.E.*, 58 F. Supp. 3d at 353-55; OCR Dear Colleague Letter: Harassment or Bullying, 4-6 (Oct. 26, 2010), available at <https://www2.ed.gov/about/offices/list/ocr/letters/colleague-201010.pdf>).

¹¹ Executive Order 13899 of December 11, 2019, Combating Anti-Semitism, 84 Fed. Reg. 68779, 68779, available at <https://www.govinfo.gov/content/pkg/FR-2019-12-16/pdf/2019-27217.pdf>.

¹² *See* Testimony of Kenneth L. Marcus, Founder and Chairman, The Louis D. Brandeis Center for Human Rights Under Law, “Free Speech on College Campuses” Testimony Before the United States House Committee on the Judiciary, Nov. 8, 2023, at 3-4, available at <https://judiciary.house.gov/sites/evo-subsites/republicans-judiciary.house.gov/files/evo-media-document/marcus-testimony.pdf>. Mr. Marcus served as Assistant Secretary, Office of Civil Rights, during the prior administration.



UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
OFFICE FOR CIVIL RIGHTS

8TH FLOOR, 5 POST OFFICE SQUARE
BOSTON, MA 02109-3921

REGION I

CONNECTICUT
MAINE
MASSACHUSETTS
NEW HAMPSHIRE
RHODE ISLAND
VERMONT

January 22, 2024

Peter Salovey
President
By email: peter.salovey@yale.edu

Re: Complaint No. 01-24-2115
Yale University

Dear President Salovey:

This letter is to notify you that the U.S. Department of Education, Office for Civil Rights (OCR) has opened for investigation the above-referenced complaint filed against Yale University (University). The Complainant alleges that the University discriminated against students on the basis of national origin (shared Jewish ancestry) when it failed to respond appropriately to reports of incidents of harassment in November 2023.

OCR enforces Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 (Title VI), 42 U.S.C. Section 2000d *et seq.*, and its implementing regulation at 34 C.F.R. Part 100, which prohibit discrimination on the basis of race, color, or national origin in any program or activity receiving federal financial assistance from the U.S. Department of Education. Because the University receives federal financial assistance from the U.S. Department of Education, OCR has jurisdiction over it pursuant to Title VI.

OCR will investigate whether the University failed to respond to alleged harassment of students based on national origin (shared Jewish ancestry) in a manner consistent with the requirements of Title VI.

Please note that opening the complaint for investigation in no way implies that OCR has made a determination on the merits of the complaint. During the investigation, OCR is a neutral fact-finder, collecting and analyzing relevant evidence from the Complainant, the University, and other sources, as appropriate. OCR will ensure that its investigation is legally sufficient and fully responds to the allegation in accordance with the provisions of the Case Processing Manual. Please also note that complainants may have the right to file a private suit in federal court whether or not OCR finds a violation.

Our goal is the prompt resolution of the complaint. Information on OCR's complaint processing procedures is available online. In particular, please note the section on mediation. Under this voluntary, informal approach, OCR helps facilitate settlement discussions between the Complainant and the University. If you believe mediation can be useful in this case, please contact OCR as soon as possible.

Please also note the section on resolution of a complaint prior to the conclusion of an investigation. If the University expresses an interest in resolving the complaint and OCR determines that resolution of the complaint prior to the completion of the investigation is appropriate, OCR may attempt to negotiate an agreement with the University pursuant to Section 302 of the *Case Processing Manual*.

Attached is a request for data necessary to investigate this complaint. OCR requests that the University submit this information within 15 calendar days of the date of this letter. We prefer that you submit information electronically, if feasible. If any item in our request is unclear, or if you experience any difficulty complying with this request, please contact us as provided below prior to the expiration of the 15-day period. Please be aware that OCR may need to make additional requests for information in the future. If OCR needs to conduct witness interviews and/or an on-site investigation, we will notify you in advance.

Please be advised that the University must not harass, coerce, intimidate, discriminate, or otherwise retaliate against an individual because that individual asserts a right or privilege under a law enforced by OCR or files a complaint, testifies, assists, or participates in a proceeding under a law enforced by OCR. If this happens, the individual may file a retaliation complaint with OCR.

Under the Freedom of Information Act, it may be necessary to release this document and related correspondence and records upon request. If OCR receives such a request, we will seek to protect personally identifiable information that could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy if released, to the extent provided by law.

If you have any questions, you may contact Paul Easton at Paul.Easton@ed.gov or 617-289-0008.

Sincerely,

(b)(6); (b)(7)(A); (b)(7)(C)

Paul Easton
Supervisory General Attorney